Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board

Independent Accountants' Report on Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures

July 1, 2023 through June 30, 2024

Griffin & Furman, LLC Certified Public Accountants

Federal Tax ID Number: 72-1506949

205 E. Lockwood St. Covington, LA 70433 ② 985-727-9924 Fax: 985-400-5026 2915 S. Sherwood Forest Blvd.
Suite B
Baton Rouge, LA 70816
② 225-292-7434
Fax: 225-293-3651

3711 Cypress St. #2 West Monroe, LA 71291 @ 318-397-2472

Contact: Robert F. Furman, CPA rfurman@griffinandco.com



Stephen M. Griffin, CPA Robert J. Furman, CPA

Howard P. Vollenweider, CPA Jessica S. Benjamin Racheal D. Alvey

Michael R. Choate, CPA

American Society of Certified Public Accountants Society of Louisiana CPAs

<u>Independent Accountants' Report</u> On Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures

To the Board of Commissioners Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board Baton Rouge, Louisiana

We have performed the procedures enumerated below as they are a required part of the engagement. We are required to perform each procedure and report the results, including any exceptions. Management is required to provide a corrective action plan that addresses all exceptions noted. For any procedures that do not apply, we have marked "not applicable."

Management of the Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board, (the Board), is responsible for its financial records, establishing internal controls over financial reporting, and compliance with applicable laws and regulations. These procedures were agreed to by management of the Board and the Legislative Auditor, State of Louisiana, solely to assist the users in assessing certain controls and in evaluating management's assertions about the Board's compliance with certain laws and regulations during the period of July 1, 2023 thru June 30, 2024.

This agreed-upon procedures engagement was performed in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants and applicable standards of *Government Auditing Standards*. The sufficiency of these procedures is solely the responsibility of the specified users of this report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

- 1. Obtain and inspect the entity's written policies and procedures and observe that they address each of the following categories and subcategories, as applicable:
 - a) Budgeting, including preparing, adopting, monitoring, and amending the budget.
 - b) Purchasing, including (1) how purchases are initiated; (2) how vendors are added to the vendor list; (3) the preparation and approval process of purchase requisitions and purchase orders; (4) controls to ensure compliance with the public bid law or state purchasing rules and regulations, as applicable to the entity; and (5) documentation required to be maintained for all bids and price quotes.
 - c) Disbursements, including processing, reviewing, and approving.
 - d) Receipts/Collections, including receiving, recording, and preparing deposits. Also, policies and procedures should include management's actions to determine the completeness of all collections for each type of revenue (e.g. periodic confirmation with outside parties, reconciliation of receipt number sequences, reasonableness of cash collections based on licenses issued).
 - e) Payroll/Personnel, including (1) payroll processing, and (2) reviewing and approving time and attendance records, including leave and overtime worked.
 - f) Contracting, including (1) types of services requiring written contracts, (2) standard terms and conditions, (3) legal review, (4) approval process, and (5) monitoring process.
 - g) Credit Cards (and debit cards, fuel cards, P-Cards, if applicable), including (1) how cards are to be controlled, (2) allowable business uses, (3) documentation requirements, (4) required approvers of statements, and (5) monitoring card usage (e.g. determining the reasonableness of fuel card purchases).
 - h) *Travel and expense reimbursement*, including (1) allowable expenses, (2) dollar thresholds by category of expense, (2) documentation requirements, (3) timeframe in which requests must be submitted and (4) required approvers.
 - i) *Ethics*, including (1) the prohibitions as defined in Louisiana Revised Statute (R.S.) 42:1111-1121, (2) actions to be taken if an ethics violation takes place, (3) system to monitor possible ethics violations, and (4) requirement that all employees annually attest through signature verification that they have read the entity's ethics policy.
 - j) Debt Service, including (1) debt issuance approval, (2) continuing disclosure/EMMA reporting requirements, (3) debt reserve requirements, and (4) debt service requirements.
 - k) Disaster Recovery/Business Continuity, including (1) identification of critical data and frequency of data backups, (2) storage of backups in a separate physical location isolated from the network, (3) periodic testing/verification that backups can be restored, (4) use of antivirus software on all systems, (5) timely application of all available system and software patches/updates, and (6) identification of personnel, processes, and tools needed to recover operations after a critical event.

Procedure performed without exception.

For Debt Services, the entity follows the policies and procedures of the State of Louisiana; they do not have a separate policy.

Annual Fiscal Report (AFR)

2. Obtain the financial statements from the AFR submitted to the Division of Administration's (DOA) Office of Statewide Reporting and Accounting Policy for the current and prior periods. Perform analytical procedures comparing current and prior period amounts, by line item. Report any variances of 10% of greater for line items that are 10% or more of the respective total assets/deferred outflows of resources, liabilities/deferred inflows of resources, net position, revenues, or expenses, and management's explanation of the variance.

Results:

We obtained the 2023 and 2024 submitted AFR and performed the above analytical procedures. We noted that there is a variance of more than 10% for the following line items:

- Licenses, Permits, and Fees decreased by \$53,895 or 11.2%. The decrease was due to a lack of AMC license renewals and initial trainee licensee interest in the industry during this engagement period.
- Cash increased by \$256,969 or 56.3%. The increase was primarily due to a decrease in expenditures for the year, specifically personnel and travel.

Board Meetings/Minutes

- 3. Obtain and inspect the board minutes for the fiscal period, as well as the board's enabling legislation, charter, bylaws, or equivalent document in effect during the fiscal period, and:
 - a) Observe that the board met with a quorum at least monthly, or on a frequency in accordance with the board's enabling legislation, charter, or other equivalent document.
 - b) Observe that the minutes referenced or included monthly budget-to-actual comparisons.
 - c) Access the entity's online information included in the DOA's boards and commissions database (https://www.cfprd.doa.louisiana.gov/boardsandcommissions/home.cfm) and observe that the entity submitted board meeting minutes for all meetings during the fiscal period.

Results:

Procedure performed with one exception.

The May 2024 Board minutes were not yet uploaded to the DOA's website.

Corrective Actions:

We recommend the Board posts the minutes promptly after finalizing.

Bank Reconciliations

- 4. Obtain a listing of bank accounts for the fiscal period from management and management's representation that the listing is complete. For each of the bank accounts in the listing provided by management, obtain bank statements and reconciliations for all months in the fiscal period and observe that:
 - a) Bank reconciliations include evidence that they were prepared within 2 months of the related statement closing date (e.g., initialed and dated, electronically logged).
 - b) Bank reconciliations include evidence that a member of management/board member who does not handle cash, post ledgers, or issue checks has reviewed each bank reconciliation (e.g., initialed and dated, electronically logged).
 - c) Management has documentation reflecting that it has researched reconciling items that have been outstanding for more than 6 months at the statement closing date.
 - d) The reconciled balance for the final month of the fiscal period agrees to the general ledger.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

Receipts/Collections

- 5. Obtain and inspect written policies and procedures relating to employees' job duties (if no written policies or procedures, inquire of employees about their job duties), and observe that job duties for collections are properly segregated such that:
 - a) Each employee responsible for collecting cash is not responsible for preparing/making bank deposits, unless another employee/official is responsible for reconciling collection documentation (e.g., pre-numbered receipts or license applications received) to the deposit.
 - b) Each employee responsible for collecting cash is not responsible for posting collection entries to the general ledger or subsidiary ledgers, unless another employee/official is responsible for reconciling ledger postings to each other and to the deposit.
 - c) The employee(s) responsible for /reconciling cash collections to the general ledger and/or subsidiary ledgers, by revenue source are not responsible for collecting cash, unless another employee verifies the reconciliation.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

6. Inquire of management that all employees who have access to cash are covered by a bond or insurance policy for theft.

Results.

Per inquiry, employees are covered by an insurance policy. Procedure performed without exception.

- 7. Randomly select 5 deposit dates for each of the bank accounts (select the next deposit date chronologically if no deposits were made on the dates randomly selected and randomly select a deposit if multiple deposits are made on the same day). Alternately, the practitioner may use a source document other than bank statements when selecting the deposit dates for testing, such as a cash collection log, daily revenue report, receipt book, etc. Obtain supporting documentation for each of the 5 deposits for each bank account and:
 - a) Trace sequentially pre-numbered receipts, system reports, and other related collection documentation to the deposit slip.
 - b) Trace the deposit slip total to the actual deposit per the bank statement.
 - c) Observe that the deposit was made within one business day of collection (within one week if the depository is more than 10 miles from the collection location or the deposit is less than \$100).
 - d) Trace the actual deposit per the bank statement to the general ledger.

Procedure performed without exception.

8. Obtain and inspect written policies and procedures (if no written policies and procedures, inquire to management) and observe that there is a process performed to determine completeness of all collections, including electronic transfers, for each revenue source (e.g. periodic confirmation with outside parties, reconciliation of receipt number sequences, reasonableness of cash collections based on licenses issued) by a person who is not responsible for collections.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

- 9. For licensing boards, obtain a list of initial and renewal licenses granted during the period from management and management's representation that the listing is complete. Randomly select 10 individual applicants from the listing and obtain the supporting documentation (e.g. application, copy of check) from management and:
 - a) Observe that the fee paid for license was the appropriate fee based on the applicable fee schedule established by the board or statute.
 - b) If a penalty was assessed (e.g. late fee), observe that the penalty was assessed and collected in accordance with the board's policies.

Results:

Procedure a) was performed without exception. Procedure b) is not applicable.

10. For licensing boards, obtain and inspect the board's written policies and procedures for granting licenses (if no written policies and procedures, inquire to management) and observe that there is a process performed to ensure licensees meet the licensure requirements established by the board or statute, as applicable. For the 10 individual applicants selected in the previous step that were granted

- 11. initial or renewal licenses during the period, request the supporting documentation (e.g. licensee file) from management and:
 - a) Observe that the board followed the established process to issue or renew the license.
 - b) Observe the documentation contains evidence that the licensee meets or continues to meet (if renewal) the licensure requirements established by the board or statute, as applicable.
 - c) Observe that the license was granted or approved by the board or the designated board member(s), as applicable.

Procedure performed without exception.

12. For levee districts, obtain independent confirmation of the tax amounts received from the appropriate parish Sherriff's offices. Observe that the confirmed amount agrees to the amount deposited by levee district.

Results:

Not applicable.

Non-Payroll Disbursements (excluding card purchases/payments, travel reimbursements, and petty cash purchases)

- 13. Obtain a listing of those employees involved with non-payroll purchasing and payment functions. Obtain written policies and procedures relating to employees' job duties (if the agency has no written policies and procedures, inquire of employees about their job duties), and observe that job duties are properly segregated such that:
 - a) At least two employees are involved in initiating a purchase request, approving a purchase, and placing an order/making the purchase.
 - b) At least two employees are involved in processing and approving payments to vendors.
 - c) The employee responsible for processing payments is prohibited from adding/modifying vendor files, unless another employee is responsible for periodically reviewing changes to vendor files.
 - d) Either the employee/official responsible for signing checks mails the payment or gives the signed checks to an employee to mail who is not responsible for processing payments.

Results:

For procedure a), per discussion with the Fiscal Officer, each purchase request is made by staff and signed off by the supervisor of their department.

For procedure b), per discussion with the Board, the Fiscal Officer and Executive Director are invoiced in processing vendor payments.

For procedure c), per discussion with management, a staff member is tasked with changing vendor files and another staff member reviews these changes.

For procedure d), per discussion with management, the Executive Director signs checks and gives the checks to the clerk for mailing. The clerk is not involved in the payment process.

14. Obtain the entity's non-payroll disbursement transaction population (excluding cards and travel reimbursements which are addressed in separate sections below) and obtain management's representation that the population is complete. Randomly select 5 disbursements, obtain supporting documentation (e.g. purchase requisition, invoices, receipts, receiving slips) for each transaction and:

Select random 5 expenses from the Expense Detail

- a) Observe that the disbursement matched the related original invoice/billing statement.
- b) Observe that the disbursement documentation included evidence (e.g. initial/date, electronic logging) of segregation of duties tested under #12, as applicable.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

Credit Cards/Debit Cards/Fuel Cards/P-Cards

- 15. Obtain from management a listing of all active credit cards, bank debit cards, fuel cards, and P-cards (cards) for the fiscal period, including the card numbers and the names of the persons who maintained possession of the cards. Obtain management's representation that the listing is complete. Randomly select 2 monthly statements or combined statements for each card (for a debit card, randomly select 2 monthly bank statements), obtain supporting documentation, and:
 - a) Observe that there is evidence that the monthly statement or combined statement and supporting documentation (e.g. original receipts for credit/debit card purchases, exception reports for excessive fuel card usage) was reviewed and approved, in writing (or electronically approved), by someone other than the authorized card holder.
 - b) Observe that finance charges and late fees were not assessed on the selected statements.

Results:

The entity has one credit card that they share with the Louisiana Real Estate Commission Board. They also have a fuel card for travel purposes. The cards are kept in a safe and must be signed out and approved by their supervisor. Procedure performed without exception.

16. Obtain supporting documentation for all transactions included on the monthly statements or combined statements selected in #14 above. For each transaction, observe that it is supported by (1) an original itemized receipt that identifies precisely what was purchased, (2) written documentation of the business/public purpose, and (3) documentation of the individuals participating in meals (for meal charges only). For missing receipts, the practitioner should describe the nature of the transaction and note whether management had a compensating control to address missing receipts, such as a "missing receipt statement" that is subject to increased scrutiny.

Procedure performed without exception.

Travel and Travel-Related Expense Reimbursements (excluding card transactions).

- 17. Obtain from management a listing of all travel and travel-related expense reimbursements paid to employees and board members during the fiscal period and management's representation that the listing or general ledger is complete. Randomly select 5 reimbursements, obtain the related expense reimbursement forms/prepaid expense documentation of each selected reimbursement, as well as the supporting documentation. For each of the 5 reimbursements selected:
 - a) If reimbursed using a per diem, agree the reimbursement rate to those rates established either by the State of Louisiana in PPM49 (https://www.doa.la.gov/pages/osp/travel/TravelPolicy.aspx) or the U.S. General Services Administration (www.gsa.gov).
 - b) If reimbursed using actual costs, observe that the reimbursement is supported by an original itemized receipt that identifies precisely what was purchased.
 - c) Observe that each reimbursement is supported by documentation of the business/public purpose (for meal charges, observe that the documentation includes the names of those individuals participating) and other documentation required by written policy (procedure #1h).
 - d) Observe that each reimbursement was reviewed and approved, in writing, by someone other than the person receiving reimbursement.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

Contracts

- 18. Obtain from management a listing of all agreements/contracts for professional services, materials and supplies, leases, and construction activities that were initiated or renewed during the fiscal period. *Alternately, the practitioner may use an equivalent selection source, such as an active vendor list.* Obtain management's representation that the listing is complete. Randomly select 5 contracts (or all contracts if less than 5) from the listing, excluding the practitioner's contract, and:
 - a) Observe that the contract was bid in accordance with the Louisiana Procurement Code or the Louisiana Public Bid Law (e.g., solicited quotes or bids, advertised), if required by law.
 - b) Observe that the contract was approved by the governing body/board, if required by policy.
 - c) If the contract was amended (e.g., change order), observe that the original contract terms provided for such an amendment.
 - d) Randomly select one payment from the fiscal period for each of the 5 contracts, obtain the supporting invoice, agree the invoice to the contract terms, and observe that the invoice and related payment agreed to the terms and conditions of the contract.

Procedure performed without exception.

Payroll and Personnel

19. Obtain a listing of employees employed during the fiscal period, and management's representation that the listing is complete. Randomly select 5 employees (or select all employees if less than 5), obtain related paid salaries and personnel files, and agree paid salaries to authorized salaries/pay rates in the personnel files.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

- 20. Randomly select 2 pay periods during the fiscal period. For the employees selected under #17 above, obtain attendance records and leave documentation for the pay period, and:
 - a) Observe that all selected employees documented their daily attendance and leave (e.g., vacation, sick, compensatory).
 - b) Observe that supervisors approved the attendance and leave of the selected employees.
 - c) Observe that any leave accrued or taken during the pay period is reflected in the entity's cumulative leave records.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

21. Obtain a listing of those employees that received termination payments during the fiscal period and management's representation that the list is complete. Randomly select 2 employees, obtain related documentation of the hours and pay rates used in management's termination payment calculations, agree the hours to the employees' cumulative leave records, and agree the pay rates to the employees' authorized pay rates in the employees' personnel files.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

22. Obtain management's representation that employer and employee portions of payroll taxes, retirement contributions, health insurance premiums, and workers' compensation premiums have been paid, and associated forms have been filed, by required deadlines.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

- 23. Using the 5 randomly selected employees from procedure #17 under "Payroll and Personnel" above obtain ethics documentation from management, and:
 - a) Observe that the documentation demonstrates each employee completed one hour of ethics training during the fiscal period.
 - b) Observe that the documentation demonstrates each employee attested through signature verification that he or she has read the entity's ethics policy during the fiscal period.

Procedure performed without exception.

24. Obtain a listing of board members from management. Randomly select 5 board members and observe documentation to demonstrate that required annual ethics training was completed

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

Budget

25. Obtain a copy of the legally adopted budget, including all amendments, and the board minutes. Observe the minutes contain approval of the budget and amendments.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

26. Compare the total revenues and total expenditures of the final budget to actual total revenues and total expenditures on the financial statements or AFR. Report variances of 10% or greater.

Results:

We compared the total revenues and total expenditures of the final budget to the actual total revenues and expenditures on the AFR and there were no variances greater than 10%

27. Inquire of management whether the entity has updated its budget information in the DOA's boards and commissions database referred to in #3 above for the current fiscal period (i.e. period covered in these procedures). Access the online database and obtain the budget information for the current fiscal period. Observe that the budget information contained in the database agrees to the budget adopted by the entity's board.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

Debt Service

28. Obtain a listing of bonds/notes issued during the fiscal period and management's representation that the listing is complete. Select all bonds/notes on the listing, obtain supporting documentation, and observe that State Bond Commission approval was obtained for each bond/note issued.

Results:

Not applicable.

29. Obtain a listing of bonds/notes outstanding at the end of the fiscal period and management's representation that the listing is complete. Randomly select one bond/note, inspect debt covenants, obtain supporting documentation for the reserve balance and payments, and agree actual reserve balances and payments to those required by debt covenants (including contingency funds, short-lived asset funds, or other funds required by the debt covenants).

Results:

Not applicable.

Sexual Harassment

30. Obtain and inspect the entity's written sexual harassment policies and procedures and observe that they address all requirements of R.S. 42:342-344, including agency responsibilities and prohibitions; annual employee training; and annual reporting requirements.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

31. Obtain a listing of employees/board members employed during the fiscal period and management's representation that the listing is complete. Randomly select 5 employees/board members, obtain sexual harassment training documentation from management, and observe that the documentation demonstrates each employee/board member completed at least one hour of sexual harassment training during the calendar year.

Results:

We randomly selected five employees, obtained sexual harassment training documentation from management, and observed that the documentation demonstrates each employee completed at least one hour of sexual harassment training during the year without exception. Of the five individuals chosen, one was a newly appointed Board Member on December 15, 2023 who has until December 2024 to complete their training.

32. Observe that the entity has posted its sexual harassment policy and complaint procedure on its website (or in a conspicuous location on the entity's premises if the entity does not have a website).

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

33. Obtain the entity's annual sexual harassment report for the current fiscal period, observe that the report was dated on or before February 1, and observe that it includes the applicable requirements of R.S. 42:344.

Results:

Procedure performed without exception.

Other

34. Obtain a listing of misappropriations of public funds and assets during the fiscal period and management's representation that the listing is complete. Select all misappropriations on the listing, obtain supporting documentation, and observe that the entity reported the misappropriation(s) to the legislative auditor and the district attorney of the parish in which the entity is domiciled.

Results:

Not applicable.

35. Observe that the entity has posted on its premises and website, the notice required by R.S. 24:523.1 concerning the reporting of misappropriation, fraud, waste, or abuse of public funds. This notice is available for download or print at www.lla.la.gov/hotline.

Results:

Not applicable.

We were engaged by Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board to perform this agreed-upon procedures engagement and conducted our engagement in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants and applicable standards of *Government Auditing Standards*. An agreed-upon procedures engagement involves the practitioner performing specific procedures that the engaging party has agreed to and acknowledged to be appropriate for the intended purpose of the engagement and reporting findings based on the procedures performed. We were not engaged to and did not conduct an examination or review engagement, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on the Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board's internal controls and compliance with laws and regulations. Accordingly, we do not express such an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

We are required to be independent of Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board and to meet our ethical responsibilities, in accordance with the relevant ethical requirements related to our agreed-upon procedures engagement.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board and the Louisiana Legislative Auditor and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than those specified parties. Under R.S. 24:513, this report is distributed by the Louisiana Legislative Auditor as a public document.

Griffin & Furman, LLC

September 25, 2024 Covington, LA

LOUISIANA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD STATE OF LOUISIANA

Schedule of Findings

For the Year Ended June 30, 2024

2024-1 Board Meetings/Minutes

Procedure: Obtain and inspect the board minutes for the fiscal period, as well as the board's enabling legislation, charter, bylaws, or equivalent document in effect during the fiscal period, and:

- a) Observe that the board met with a quorum at least monthly, or on a frequency in accordance with the board's enabling legislation, charter, or other equivalent document.
- b) Observe that the minutes referenced or included monthly budget-to-actual comparisons.
- c) Access the entity's online information included in the DOA's boards and commissions database (https://www.cfprd.doa.louisiana.gov/boardsandcommissions/home.cfm) and observe that the entity submitted board meeting minutes for all meetings during the fiscal period.

Finding: Procedure performed with one exception. The May 2024 Board Minutes were not yet uploaded to the DOA's website.

Recommendation: We recommend the Board posts the minutes promptly after finalizing.

Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board State of Louisiana

Office of the Governor

JEFF LANDRY
GOVERNOR



TAYLOR F. BARRAS

September 25, 2024

Griffin & Furman, LLC 205 E. Lockwood Street Covington, Louisiana 70433

Re: FY 2023-2024 Agreed Upon Procedures Schedule of Findings

Dear Mr. Furman,

In response to the above referenced Schedule of Findings, the Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board acknowledges the finding and agrees to take the following corrective actions.

2024-1 Board Meetings/Minutes

Procedure: Obtain and inspect the board minutes for the fiscal period, as well as the board's enabling legislation, charter, bylaws, or equivalent document in effect during the fiscal period, and:

- a) Observe that the board met with a quorum at least monthly, or on a frequency in accordance with the board's enabling legislation, charter, or other equivalent document.
- b) Observe that the minutes referenced or included monthly budget-to-actual comparisons.
- c) Access the entity's online information included in the DOA's boards and commissions database (https://www.cfprd.doa.louisiana.gov/boardsandcommissions/home.cfm) and observe that the entity submitted board meeting minutes for all meetings during the fiscal period.

Finding: Procedure performed with one exception. The May 2024 Board Minutes were not yet uploaded to the DOA's website.

Recommendation: We recommend the Board posts the minutes promptly after finalizing.

Corrective action: Louisiana Real Estate Appraisers Board will ensure Board minutes are posted promptly to the DOA website.

Sincerely,

Summer S. Mire

Executive Director

Summer S. M.

LOUISIANA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD STATE OF LOUISIANA

Status of Prior Year Findings

For the Year Ended June 30, 2023

There were no corrective actions from prior year.